

**STATE OF TEXAS
COUNTY OF GILLESPIE
CITY OF FREDERICKSBURG**

**HISTORIC REVIEW BOARD
MAY 14, 2019
5:30 PM**

On this 14th day of May 2019 the Historic Review Board convened in regular session at the Law Enforcement Center, with the following members present to constitute a quorum:

PRESENT: ERIC PARKER
 LARRY JACKSON
 JERRY SAMPLE
 DAVID BULLION
 KAREN OESTREICH
 BRAD BERTRAND (alternate)
 RICHARD LAUGHLIN (alternate)
 SHARON JOSEPH
 JESSICA DAVIS (alternate)

ABSENT: MIKE PENICK

ALSO PRESENT: ANNA HUDSON – Historic Preservation Officer
 DANIEL JONES – City Attorney
 SHELBY COLLIER – Development Coordinator

Sharon Joseph called the meeting to order at 5:30 PM.

MINUTES

April Minutes will need to be brought back for approval.

STAFF ANNOUNCEMENTS

Anna Hudson, Historic Preservation Officer, provided a list of administrative approvals she has issued since the last meeting. She also provided an update regarding the P&Z meeting for the Historic District Expansion. She encouraged the Board to attend the upcoming Council Meeting. Anna also reminded the Board that May is National Preservation Month and reminded the Board if they are on social media to utilize the “this place matters”

APPLICATIONS

CONSENT AGENDA

Application #19-51 – 325 W. Main – Pioneer Museum– Addition of wood faux water storage tank to existing structure.

Application #19-56 – 420 W. Austin – Kevin Vinall – Carport and masonry wall demolition.

Application #19-54 – 115 E. Austin – Jim Carpenter– Partial demolition, new 2 story addition, new construction of 2 story B&B unit.

The items under the consent agenda are deemed by the Commission to be routing in nature and will be approved by one motion adopting the staff findings and recommendation as part of the approval. The items on the consent agenda will not be discussed. Any member of the Commission or the public desiring to discuss an item on the consent agenda may request that it be removed and placed on the individual consideration agenda.

Karen Oestreich moved to approve the consent agenda as presented. Eric Parker seconded the motion. All voted in favor and the motion carried.

Application # 19-57 – 418 W. Austin – Kevin Vinall– Carport demolition, deck reconfiguration, paint, non-original window/door replacement.

Anna stated the applicant is requesting “extra white” paint on exterior siding, fascia, windows, front door and trim “Bohemian Black”, replace front stepping stones with concrete walkway, remove carport and storage building, install 6’ privacy fence around deck, reconfigure deck and exterior stair and replace windows on addition with French doors

Staff Recommendation:

The pressed metal has been painted many times since installed in the early 1900’s and the rock walkway is present in the RTHL nomination photo. However, the property’s use as a STR makes the uneven surface a liability. Staff recommends approval of the change in material.

The carport and storage building do not appear to be of historic age and do not add to the integrity of the property. Staff recommends approval of demolition.

The deck was added in 1984. Staff recommends the reconfiguration and addition of privacy fence.

The house had an exterior stair or access to the sleeping quarters when it was used as a Sunday house by the Vogels. The existing stair was added in 2003. The current design is not the traditional simple stair commonly found on Sunday houses. Staff recommends the new design be more in keeping with simple stair with code required pickets, but not enclosed like the current stair and landing.

Staff has not been able to definitively date the addition in question, but it was present when the RTHL nomination was written in 1978. It is likely a very early addition to the house. It has the same pressed

metal as the main house. Staff recommends the windows remain intact and the door in the newer wood siding addition be enlarged instead.

Kevin Vinall presented the application. He stated both properties have been purchased with the intent to rent as Short Term Rentals. They would like to gain more access to the deck and the request is an attempt to facilitate the flow of the ideal Short Term Rental with the addition of a fence for privacy.

Sharon asked Anna to clarify her recommendation. Anna provided a picture of the deck and exterior door and commented on her desire to have the exterior door enlarged as opposed to creating a new door.

David Bullion asked if there is pressed tin on the western side of the building. Anna stated no.

Jerry Sample asked what the vent was in the photo. Kevin stated he believe it was for a window unit.

Richard asked if there would rebuild the stairway. Kevin said they would narrow the steps but no other work would be done to the stairway.

Brad asked if the exterior walls on the stairways would be redone. Kevin stated no.

Anna stated no drawing was submitted depicting the stairway so it is difficult to provide a recommendation but she would recommend the stairway be replaced with her listed recommendation.

Robert Zamora, the owner, spoke regarding his intent for the property.

Sharon asked how Robert Zamora felt regarding the recommendation of changing the stairway. He stated it was not an issue as long as they could build the fence.

David asked if the applicant would be willing to change the design of the stairway and the stairs to the landing. Kevin stated he did not feel that was an issue.

Jerry stated on the drawing it depicts 40" wide. He encouraged the applicant to keep the Building Code in mind while constructing this.

Brad Bertrand commented on the lack of detailed drawings. Jerry Sample commented on the lack of listed materials such as windows.

Richard asked if Anna provided a Recommendation on the Black and White color scheme. Anna stated in reading the RTHL nomination the house has been painted many colors and provided no Recommendation.

Richard motion to approve items number 2 & 3 of Application #19-57 and have applicant return with more information. Eric seconded. All voted in favor and the motion carried.

Kevin request permission to resurface the deck as well.

Jerry Sample commented on the request of resurfacing the deck. He stated if the stairway is moved or

changed the deck would need to be redone again.

Robert Zamora asked the Board for approval of the two doors to the deck. Sharon stated that was not included in the motion so they will not be approved at this time. Kevin asked what about the doors was displeasing. Richard stated it was an issue of a lack of understanding of the overall project not to mention he does not want to change a 150 year old building to meet the STR trend.

Application #19-58 – 705 N. Elk – City of Fredericksburg – Recommendation of landmark designation.

Richard Laughlin recused himself and left the table.

Anna stated The iconic house at 705 N. Elk was built for Reuben Eckhardt in 1964-1965. It was designed by San Antonio architect Ed Nicholson, AIA who also designed the Community Savings and Loan in 1962 at 300 W Main Street. Mr. Eckhardt was VP of the Savings and Loan at the time Mr. Nicholson was hired and likely employed him to design his personal residence after the experience of working with him at the Savings and Loan. The house embodies many of quintessential design feature of mid-century modern homes and retains a high level of integrity. The way it is oriented on the lot around mature live oak trees, the way it interacts with the landscape, the use of modern materials and angles all create a landmark house that is well known throughout the community.

Reuben Hugo Eckhardt (1916-1990) was born and raised in Fredericksburg. He went to college at Southwest Texas University in San Marcos, earning a BA in math and business administration. He taught for three years at Willow City. He joined Community Savings in 1939 before joining the Air Force where he served as a B-17 pilot in the European Theatre, earning the rank of major. His plane was shot down by German fighter planes while flying over Pas-DeCalaise, France. He was listed as MIA in December of 1943. He made his way to England in March of 1944. He was then assigned to Roswell NM as an instructor on B-17's and B-29s. He was discharged in 1946 from San Antonio. He rejoined Community Savings in 1953. He and his wife Irene Bergmann had four children. Mr. Eckhardt was a prominent member of Fredericksburg as a businessman and member of different boards and associations. He served as a councilman and treasurer at Bethany Lutheran Church, he was a member of the Jaycees, Historical Society, and supervised Community Chest drives. He also sat on the Board of Directors for Hill County Memorial Hospital, was a member of the Chamber of Commerce and first vice president of the State Hermann Sons Bowling Association.

Hubert Edwin (Ed) Nicholson, AIA (1924-2009) was an architect and engineer based out of San Antonio, Tx. He practiced architecture for over 50 years designing everything from private residences to shopping centers, to track homes to warehouses. He was best known for his church designs. He obtained his professional architecture license in 1951 after getting a bachelors in architectural engineering and degree in architecture from the University of Texas at Austin.

Mid Century Modern architecture refers to the time period between the 1930s and 1960s. It was a movement away from traditional and classical styles. The contemporary styles focused on function and downplayed ornamentation. There are three dominant characteristics of mid-century modern homes: a clean, minimalist aesthetic, an emphasis on bringing the outdoors in, and angular structures.

The residence at 705 N Elk exhibits all three of these characteristics. The brick work is a combination

of three colors reminiscent of pink granite. The long thin brick is not a common size and measures approximately 2 5/16" x 15 5/8" is laid in a 1/4 off set running bond. The house has little ornamentation but lots of angles. It was designed around 2 large live oak trees with large expanse of glass, bringing the outside in. The lot is on the edge of the city limits and tucked away from the rest of the neighborhood. It is not oriented in a traditional lot development. The front door is diminutive with a simple concrete stoop. The awning windows allowed for cross ventilation as the house was not designed with central air. The house is rare for Fredericksburg in that it has a basement garage with living quarters above.

Based on A Field Guide to American Houses by Virginia and Lee McAlester this house would be categorized as Contemporary with gabled roof. One of the most notable features is the "pointed" front gable supported by a pier. The house boasts extra wide 42" overhanging eaves. The aluminum awning windows with horizontal muntins re-enforce the horizontal focus with the extra-long brick. The basement garage also makes this house a split level in that one goes up a half a flight of stairs to go to the bedrooms from the kitchen or down half a flight of stairs to go to the garage.

The house has significance and retains an incredibly high level of integrity and has virtually been unchanged. Staff recommends the property be given a survey rating of "high". The current owners are only the second family to own the house.

Justin and Celine Ord spoke regarding the nomination. They moved to Fredericksburg in December 2017. They have owned 2 mid-century homes and remodeled both and they have won awards for national attention. They worked with an architect and attempted to save the property but found it is not financially feasible to remodel this property and with that they went with the second option to demolish the home. Once they visited with the City they were notified of this process. He went on to say they have invested in this property emotionally and financially. Mrs. Ord spoke that she disagrees with the landmark designation.

Sharon commented that she understands their emotion but it is the boards job to protect these buildings and the district and they can't afford to let treasures like this go.

Mr. Ord stated that prior to building of this home, they demolished a historic home to build this one.

Karen stated that is why this process is all the more important. She was on the Board when it was first created and saw a lot of homes lost. Karen went on to clarify that the Boards interest is not in preserving tourism but in preserving the uniqueness of Fredericksburg. She expressed her sympathy in their experience with this home, but The Board has a job to do as well.

Brad asked for the definition of a "medium" rated property and the difference between high and medium which Anna provided.

Sharon stated the Board making it a landmark would not preclude them from approving the desired changes. Anna commented that is correct however this landmark designation will go to City Council for consideration.

Mrs. Ord commented that she can't help but feel they are being punished and commented that this is an instance where it is better to ask for forgiveness than approval. Mr. Ord commented that he visited with Eric Mustard who told him this is a Prairie Style home and not landmark worthy.

Brad asked what type of protection available if it is not designated. Anna commented there is no protection and this was triggered by a demolition permit and there is 120 day stay due to the application. Mr. Ord asked if they could withdraw the Demolition Permit and leave it as is as they no longer intend to demo the property. Anna commented this property is known and even if the demolition permit is withdrawn, professionally, she still believes it meets landmark designation.

Mrs. Ord asked if in the future, City staff would inform buyers of this process. Anna commented that the ordinance allowing her to review demolition was enacted in 2017 and so it is a fairly new process. Mrs. Ord stated when you purchase a home the realtors should disclose information like this.

David asked what the approval rating was for the Certificate of Appropriateness Applications. Anna stated 95 %. David went on to say that this process is not something to fear, it is just a process and involves a dialog.

Sharon stated if the property is landmarked, she would encourage them to see the process through.

Larry Jackson asked with landmark status if they will have the ability to make changes. Anna stated yes.

David made motion to approve Application #19-58 as presented. Jessica Davis seconded. All voted in favor and the motion carried.

DISCUSSION ITEM

Potential design changes to 705 N. Elk

Anna explained this is feedback as the Board may not take action on this.

Brand encouraged them to have a list a materials if they return with an application.

Brad commented on preserving the Horizontal divided lights.

ACTION ITEM

Application #19-55 – 105 N. Orange – James Shifflett – New 2 story commercial building.

Anna stated the applicant is requesting approval for a new 2-story commercial building made to look like 2 distinct commercial buildings using red brick, white stone, and smart siding.

Staff Recommendation:

The massing and scale of the proposed new construction are appropriate for the empty lot in the Central Business District. However, the proposed design is not in keeping with design guidelines #4, designing new buildings with inaccurate interpretations of original styles, thus distorting the perception of genuine historic buildings. The building should be designed to look of its time and place. Traditional building materials such as brick and stone are appropriate, but the proposed design incorporates a wide variety of design features from different time periods. Staff recommends a simplified approach.

James Shifflett presented the application he stated Jim Penick is wanting to get the most he can out of the lot. They are only proposing to build the structure or shell, the interior finish out will come as the properties are rented. He commented on the water tower and their desire to make it look old and similar to a functioning water tower. The owner plans to rent the water tower as a B&B.

Sharon commented that in the Historic District they want to save old buildings not build new buildings to look old. She would like to structure to look new but blend in.

Brad asked what stage this project is in per City Development process. James stated they have already met with the City. Brad commented on a lack of detail for materials and attention to detail.

Sharon commented that there is a lack of detail and the application needs to be reworked. David said with the complexity of the design there should be a 3D elevation. Karen went on to say this style is too busy. Brad commented it is important to show the size and dimensions appropriately several are incorrect. He encouraged that a simple design is better.

The Board discussed taking no action on this application as changes need to be made. Daniel Jones, City Attorney, stated action needs to be made.

Jerry Sample moved to continue Application # 19-55 to next meeting. Karen Seconded. All voted in favor and the motion carried.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Jessica Davis would like to avoid cases like Elk Street she suggested that the Board email properties they believe would qualify for Landmark designation to Anna for discussion.

David Bullion asked if action was taken regarding the County and potential issues at the square. Daniel stated no conversations have taken place. David would like City Staff to be more proactive.

Richard Laughlin asked about a report on Travis Street. It's on the corner of Pine and Travis. Anna did not have an update, she has spoken with owner but has not received an application.

ADJOURN

With nothing further to come before the Board, Karen Oestreich moved to adjourn. Eric Parker seconded the motion All voted in favor and the meeting was adjourned at 7:15 p.m.

PASSED AND APPROVED this the 11th day of JUNE 2019.


SHELBY COLLIER, COORDINATOR


SHARON JOSEPH, CHAIRMAN